

# THE PUBLICATION OF SOURCES ON THE HISTORY OF THE 1932-1933 FAMINE- GENOCIDE: HISTORY, CURRENT STATE, AND PROSPECTS\*\*

HENNADII BORIAK

For obvious reasons the first documentary publications about the Famine-Genocide of 1932-1933 could not be based on the Ukrainian archives. Western scholars and researchers from the Ukrainian diaspora took the lead in publishing sources in order to reveal this crime. For more than half a century the only documents to bear witness to the Famine-Genocide were ones that remained outside the control of the ideological operations of the Soviet totalitarian system. Typically such evidence was revealed through the testimony of eyewitnesses who were fortunate enough to survive and flee abroad, or that of foreigners (journalists, diplomats) who were not afraid to tell the truth about the events of the 1930s on the territory of Soviet Ukraine.

The first such publication appeared as early as 1934 in Vienna in the form of a small brochure in English and German entitled *The Famine: Authentic Documentation of the Mass Starvation in the Soviet Union.*<sup>1</sup> Owing to the efforts of researchers and political leaders of the Ukrainian diaspora, the two-volume English-language collection entitled *The Black Deeds of the*

\* Reprinted from *Harvard Ukrainian Studies* 25, no. 3-4 (Fall 2001): 167-186.

\* This article is based on a paper delivered at the 35th National Convention of the American Association for the Advancement of Slavic Studies, Toronto, Canada, November 22, 2003.

<sup>1</sup> *The Famine: Authentic Documentation of the Mass Starvation in the Soviet Union* (Vienna, 1934). (In German: Theodor Innitzer, *Hungersnot: Authentische Dokumente über das Massensterben in der Sowjetunion* [Vienna, 1933].) 64 pp.

*Kremlin: A White Book* was published in Canada and the United States to commemorate the twentieth anniversary of the Famine-Genocide.<sup>2</sup> In 1966, a Spanish edition of *The Black Deeds* appeared.<sup>3</sup>

The next stage in making sources available to the public emerged as a result of the activity of the United States Senate Committee on Foreign Relations, which in August 1984 held separate hearings on the problem of the 1932-1933 Famine in Ukraine and published the testimonies of survivors and witnesses in a special volume.<sup>4</sup>

In 1987 several documents from the Italian and German diplomatic archives were published in journals and newspapers of the Ukrainian press abroad.<sup>5</sup> These publications constituted a real breakthrough for the subject,

<sup>2</sup> Semen O. Pidhainy, ed., *The Black Deeds of the Kremlin: A White Book*, 2 vols. (Toronto and Detroit, 1953-1955). (Vol. 1: *Book of the Testimonies*, ed. I. I. Sandul and A. R. Stepovy, trans. Alexander Oreletsky and Olga Prychodko, vii, 545 pp.; vol. 2: *The Great Famine in the Ukraine in 1932-1933*, ed. V. Hryshko and P. P. Pavlovych, xxiv, 720 pp.)

<sup>3</sup> *Las Negras Acetones del Kremlin: Libro Blanco*, 2 vols. (Buenos Aires, 1966-1967). (Vol. 1: *Libro de Testimonies*, 633 pp.; vol. 2: *Libro de Testimonies* [El Gran Hambre en Ucrania en 1932-1933], 797 pp.)

<sup>4</sup> Senate Committee on Foreign Relations, *Ukrainian Famine of 1932 and 1933: Hearing* [Hearing before the Committee on Foreign Relations: A Bill to Establish a Commission to Study the 1932-1933 Famine Caused by the Soviet Government in Ukraine], 98th Cong., 2nd sess., August 1, 1984 (Washington D.C.: Government Printing Office, 1984). 137 pp., illustrations.

<sup>5</sup> "Dokument pro holod" [Letter from the Italian consul Gradenigo to the Italian embassy in Moscow, 1933], *Moloda Ukraïna* (Toronto), no. 364 (1987): 8-10; "Dokument pro holod," *Patriarkhat: Za iednist' tserkvy i narodu* (Philadelphia), no. 2 (1987): 9-11. Republished as "Golod i ukrainsku vopros," *Slovo* (Kyiv), August 20-27, 1993, p. 3 (with commentary by V. Marochko); "Golod i ukrainsku vopros," *Iug*, July 27, 1999; "Holod i ukrains'ke pytannia," *Samostiina Ukraïna* (Kyiv), nos. 19-20 (May 1999): 4 [in section "Z arkhivu," *Zhnyva skorboty*, no. 4 (1999), published by the Asotsiatsiia doslidnykiv holodomoriv v Ukraïni as a supplement to *Samostiina Ukraïna*]. Materials from the Italian consul were later published in full in the original language: A. Graziosi, ed., *Lettere da Kharkov: La carestia in Ucraina e nel Caucaso del Nord nei rapporti dei diplomatici italiani, 1932-33* (Torino: Einaudi, 1991); some of these documents (translated from English) were also published in Ukraine, see "Choma pliama v istorii Ukraïny: Svidchat' italiis'ki diplomatychni dokumenty," trans. Ihor and Iryna Ievtukh, *Trybuna*, no. 1 (1991): 26-8.

For German diplomatic documents, see D. Zlepko, "Velykyi holod: Kolektyvizatsiia i pliani likvidatsii Radians'koï Ukraïny pid chas holodu 1932-33 rokiv; Na osnovi neopublikovanykh dokumentiv politychnoho arkhivu Ministerstva zakordonnykh sprav Federatyvnoï Respubliky Nimechchyny," *Visti kombatanta*, no. 4 (1987): 40-50. Within two years D. Zlepko published an entire collection of German diplomatic documents about the Famine-Genocide in German: D. Zlepko, *Der ukrainische Hunger-Holocaust: Stalins verschweigener Völkermord 1932/33 an 7 Millionen ukrainischen Bauern im Spiegel geheimgehaltener Akten des deutschen Auswärtigen Amtes* (Sonnenbühl: H. Wild, 1988), 309 pp. with illustrations and facsimiles. These are dispatches and reports of a political, social, and economic character from the consulate staff in Kharkiv and Kyiv, detailed information about the journey over Ukrainian territory made by the French premier Edouard Herriot, who after returning to the West became an apologist for Stalin.

since in the following year documents from the British Foreign Office on the Famine-Genocide also appeared.<sup>6</sup> Reports of the Italian consulates in Kharkiv, Kyiv, Odesa, Leningrad, and the embassy in Moscow for the years 1932-1935 were published as well.<sup>7</sup> In addition, the testimony of Malcolm Muggeridge, the Moscow correspondent for the *Manchester Guardian* at the time, was made public,<sup>8</sup> and photographs documenting the famine in Kharkiv were published.<sup>9</sup> These documentary publications, as well as others, owed their appearance to the activity of the International Commission of Inquiry into the 1932-1933 Famine in Ukraine as well as to the U.S. Congress Commission on the Ukraine Famine, which was created in December 1985. The latter commission supervised the oral history project of the Commission on the Ukraine Famine, which collected and published the recollections of witnesses. Developed and headed by James E. Mace, the Ukrainian

<sup>6</sup> Marco Carynnyk, Lubomyr Y. Luciuk, and Bohdan S. Kordan, eds., *The Foreign Office and the Famine: British Documents on Ukraine and the Great Famine of 1932-1933*, foreword by Michael R. Marrus (Kingston, Ont., and Vestal, N.Y.: Limestone Press, 1988). lxi, 493 pp. with map and bibliography (pp. 467-71). The Ukrainian translation of a portion of these documents was published in 1989: "Ukraina: Holod 1932-1933 rokiv; Za povidomlenniamy brytans'kykh dyplomativ," trans. Ihor Ievtukh, with a foreword by Stanislav Kul'chyts'kyi. *Vsesvit*, no. 11 (1989): 153-61. With a map.

<sup>7</sup> See United States Congress Commission on the Ukraine Famine, *Investigation of the Ukrainian Famine, 1932-1933: Report to Congress*, adopted by the Commission April 19, 1988; submitted to Congress April 22, 1988 (Washington, D.C.: Government Printing Office, 1988). xxv, 524 pp.

<sup>8</sup> "Malcolm Muggeridge," exhibit P-8, Records of the International Commission of Inquiry into the 1932-1933 Famine in Ukraine [Toronto, 1988-1990], Nobel Institute of Norway, Oslo (three articles in the *Manchester Guardian*, March 25, 27 and 28, 1933; interview by B. Nahaylo on March 1, 1983; Ian Hunter, *Malcolm Muggeridge: A Life* (Nashville: Thomas Nelson Publishers, 1980), 82-5, 246-7); "Testimony of Malcolm Muggeridge (in the presence of Kitty Muggeridge), taken at Robertsbridge, Sussex, England, on June 27, 1988, by Mr. Hunter, Ms. Chyczziy," exhibit A-6, Records of the International Commission of Inquiry into the 1932-1933 Famine in Ukraine [Toronto, 1988-1990], Nobel Institute of Norway, Oslo. 117 pp. Copies of the Records of the International Commission are also available at the Ukrainian Research Institute Library, Harvard University; the National Academy of Sciences of Ukraine, Kyiv; the Library of Congress in Washington, D.C.; as well as libraries in Stockholm, Ottawa, Toronto, Louvain, Paris, and Munich.

<sup>9</sup> "The 1932-33 Original Photographs from Kharkiv, Ukraine, submitted by William Liber, Q.C., Counsel for the World Congress of Free Ukrainians," exhibit P-42, Records of the International Commission of Inquiry into the 1932-1933 Famine in Ukraine [Toronto, 1988-1990], Nobel Institute of Norway, Oslo. 47 pp. (Reproductions of 26 photographs and excerpts from a book by Alexander Weinerberger, *Hart auf Hart: 15 Jahre Ingenieur in Sowjetrussland* [Salzburg and Leipzig: Verlag Anton Pustet, 1939], text in English and German.)

Famine Oral History Pilot Project made possible the eventual publication of a unique three-volume edition (1990), which contained more than two hundred testimonies.<sup>10</sup>

Documents from the Dnipropetrovsk archive, which Oleksa Kalynyk smuggled to the West, represent a fundamentally different type of resource. They are presently housed in New York in the archives of the Shevchenko Scientific Society. These papers contain various kinds of documentary evidence from regional and district levels for the years 1929-1933, including a unique civil register—death certificates from the village of Romankovo for 1933-1934.<sup>11</sup> Oleksa Kalynyk made some of these documents public as early as 1953. Because virtually the entire archival collection of the Registry of Vital Statistics (ZAGS) was lost during the war, the Romankovo records are, in all probability, the only source of its kind. It should be noted that the registrars in ZAGS were instructed not to record the actual cause of death, but instead to state various diagnoses, especially death by "colic," "inflammation of the intestines," "emaciation [or exhaustion]," and "feebleness from old age."

During the 1980s, with the relaxation of repression and ideological pressures, some progress on exposing the Famine-Genocide was made in Ukraine as well. It is difficult to pinpoint the exact date, but "underground" activity had clearly spread by the second half of the 1980s. In 1989-1990, Vasył Marochko and Ievheniia Shatalina published the first documentary publication in *Ukrains'kyi istorychnyi zhurnal* (Ukrainian Historical Journal).<sup>12</sup> At the beginning of 1990, the Central Committee of the Communist Party of Ukraine (CC CPU) approved a special resolution, "On the 1932-1933 Ukraine Famine and the Publication of Relevant Archival Materials," which assigned scholars at the Institute of Party History at the CC CPU the task of issuing a "collection of scholarly articles and archival documents on the 1932-1933

<sup>10</sup> United States Congress Commission on the Ukraine Famine, *Investigation of the Ukrainian Famine, 1932-1933: Oral History Project of the Commission on the Ukraine Famine*, ed. James E. Mace and Leonid Heretz, 3 vols. (Washington, D.C.: Government Printing Office, 1990). Texts in Ukrainian with English summaries.

<sup>11</sup> Oleksa Kalynyk, *Shcho nese z soboiu komunizm?* (Munich and Toronto: Spilka vyzvolennia Ukraïny, 1953). 112 pp. and 28 plates of archival photocopies. An English-language publication of Kalynyk's collection appeared under the title: *Communism: The Enemy of Mankind; Documents about the Methods and Practice of the Russian Bolshevik Occupation in Ukraine* (London: Ukrainian Youth Association in Great Britain, 1955). 120 pp., 24 pages of plates, illustrations.

<sup>12</sup> "Holod na Ukraïni (1931-1933 rr.)," with introductory notes by V. I. Marochko and Ie. P. Shatalina, *Ukrains'kyi istorychnyi zhurnal*, no. 7 (1989): 99-111; no. 8 (1989): 105-17; no. 9 (1989): 110-21; no. 11 (1989): 78-90; no. 12 (1989): 123-8; no. 1 (1990): 104-12.

Famine."<sup>13</sup> Thus appeared the important publication *Holod 1932-1933 rokiv na Ukraïni: ochyma istorykiv, movoiu dokumentiv* (The 1932-1933 Famine in Ukraine: Through the Eyes of Historians, in the Language of Documents). The year 1990 became the point of departure for a substantial disclosure of documents about the Famine from the Party archives, and in due course, the state archives, of Ukraine.

This 1932-1933 Famine collection was the first in a series of publications of so-called Party documents to disclose a substantial number of previously unknown and classified materials from the highest levels—all-Union and republic Party headquarters to local Party agencies—from January 1932 through November 1933.<sup>14</sup> The edition contains approximately 250 documents primarily from the Party archives of the Institute of Party History, CC CPU (presently the Central State Archive of Public Organizations of Ukraine, TsDAHO), a few dozen documents from the central Party archives of the Central Committee of the Communist Party of the Soviet Union (CC CPSU) (presently the Russian State Archive of Socio-Political History), and from regional Party archives. Most of the documents are memoranda from the secret police (GPU or State Political Directorate) of the Ukrainian SSR to the CC CP(b)U; from the oblast agencies of the GPU to the oblast Party committees; and memoranda and information from various judicial and prosecuting agencies concerning public opinion, the state of the food supply, and the starvation of the population in particular regions. Some statistical data were published on the number of deaths from starvation for the first time.

The 1932-1933 Famine collection of documents is a standard academic edition with all the essential features. The compilers may be criticized only for failing to include references about the "originality" of the published documents. Since the collection contains documents originating from institutions with different levels of responsibility (all-Union, republic, oblast, and district), information about whether a source is an original or a copy is extremely important for the researcher. For example, the existence of an original letter from the Secretary of the CC CPU to the CC of the all-Union

<sup>13</sup> See *Holod 1932-1933 rokiv na Ukraïni: Ochyma istorykiv, movoiu dokumentiv*, compiled by R. Ia. Pyrih et al. (Kyiv: Politytvdav Ukraïny, 1990), 3-4.

<sup>14</sup> It is worth noting that the first attempts at publishing the central Party documents related to the Famine of 1932-1933 were also realized in the West. One may cite the Records of the International Commission of Inquiry into the 1932-1933 Famine in Ukraine, exhibit P-4 ["Soviet decrees"] (texts in English, Russian, and Ukrainian); and Soviet Party and government decrees and newspaper reports concerning the 1932-33 Famine in Ukraine, compiled and translated by Marco Carynnyk (texts in English, Russian, and Ukrainian); see exhibit P-5 ["Soviet Admissions and Denials"].

Communist Party that remains in the archive of the CC CPU may serve as evidence that the letter was never sent to Moscow. The first Ukrainian documentary collection about the Famine, which was prepared with the approval and even on order of the CC CPU, provided only a survey of the Famine sources in the holdings of the Party archives, and did not explore deeply. Soon after, there appeared another fundamental publication, *Kolektyvizatsiia i holod na Ukraïni, 1929-1933* (Collectivization and Famine in Ukraine, 1929-1933),<sup>15</sup> prepared by the Institute of the History of Ukraine, National Academy of Sciences of Ukraine, together with the Central State Archive of the October Revolution and of Higher Agencies of Government (presently, the Central State Archive of Higher Agencies of Government and Administration, TsDAVO). The compilers of this publication had a somewhat different conceptual approach: namely, to show not only the horrific conditions of the Famine, but also the broad historical background of the "socialist reorganization of agriculture." In general, they avoided republishing Party documents of a directive nature. Another principal difference from the "Party collection" publication is that *Kolektyvizatsiia i holod* almost exclusively contains unclassified documents, ones that were never hidden from historians in special depositories. These published documents reflect the Famine indirectly, but very persuasively: four hundred documents present a frightening scene of the Ukrainian village trying to survive under conditions of inhuman pressure from Stalin's command system. Almost all of the documents originate from the Archive of Higher Agencies of Government, and only less than ten percent from regional archives. The momentous work of these scholars and archivists had an immediate and enormous impact on the public (the following year saw an additional printing). In hindsight, however, we should point out that the compilers did not manage to expose the specifics of the Famine-Genocide in each region, since documents from the regional state archives remained outside their purview.

The series of publications of documents from the archives of central Party and government agencies that was issued under the aegis of the Academy of Sciences of Ukraine was brought to a logical completion when the Institute of Ukrainian Archeography, National Academy of Sciences of Ukraine,

<sup>15</sup> *Kolektyvizatsiia i holod na Ukraïni, 1929-1933: Zbirnyk dokumentiv i materialiv*, compiled by H. M. Mykhailychenko and Ie. P. Shatalina, ed. S. V. Kul'chyts'kyi (Kyiv: Naukova dumka, 1992), 732 pp. Publication of the Archeographic Commission of the Institute of History of Ukraine of the Academy of Sciences of Ukraine, the Central Archival Administration at the Cabinet of Ministers of Ukraine, and Central State Archive of the October Revolution, Higher Agencies of Government, and Agencies of State Administration.

put out *Upokorennia holodom* (Suppression by Famine) for the Famines sixtieth anniversary.<sup>16</sup> This collection contains fifty-nine documents mostly from sources in foreign languages and sources that were inaccessible to the average Ukrainian reader: (1) a selection of documents from the above-mentioned collection of the Shevchenko Scientific Society in New York; (2) Ukrainian translations of British and German diplomatic reports; (3) materials from the world press; (4) minutes of hearings of the United States Congress Commission and the International Commission of Inquiry into the 1932-1933 Famine, as well as (5) the *Knyha smerti s. Romankovoho Kam'ians'koho raionu Dnipropetrovs'koï oblasti* (Death Records of the Village of Romankovo, Kam'ianske District, Dnipropetrovsk Oblast) in its entirety (including the text and a facsimile reproduction). At the beginning of 1990, copies of these archival documents were kindly provided by the Shevchenko Scientific Society to the Archeographical Commission of the Academy of Sciences of Ukraine.

As a result, an important corpus of documents from Party and law enforcement (*sylovi*) structures, central state and administrative bodies, regional agencies, as well as from foreign sources came into academic and public circulation. During the next phase, it was clear that the main task for archivists and scholars was to expand the source base through detailed examination of Famine materials in the regional document collections. Overall from the years 1992 to 2003, thirteen regional collections of archival documents and newspaper items have been published. The majority of these are textbooks and popular editions, with the exception of two (from Sumy and Cherkasy), which may be called academic publications. The publication entitled *Z istoriï holodomoru 1932-1933 rr. na Sumshchyni* (From the History of the Famine of 1932-1933 in the Sumy Region) published by the Sumy Archive, which has an original format and is exceptionally well produced, contains essays, a catalog of four hundred archival documents, and a complete list of ninety-five archival fonds [collections] and published sources.<sup>17</sup>

In total, the regional editions contain more than five hundred documents. A general and rather odd shortcoming of all the documentary publications is their lack of a necessary feature of scholarship; namely, a list of the fonds from which the documents came. Perhaps this shortcoming is a relic of Soviet practices in publishing texts.

<sup>16</sup> Maryna Mukhina, *Upokorennia holodom: Zbirnyk dokumentiv*, (Kyiv: Instytut ukrains'koï arkhеоhrafii AN Ukraïny, 1993). 309 pp.

<sup>17</sup> L. A. Pokydenko, ed., *Z istoriï holodomoru 1932-1933 rr. na Sumshchyni* (Sumy: Derzhavnyi arkhiv Sums'koï oblasti, 2002). 61 pp.

The testimonies and memoirs of eyewitnesses—participants and observers of those terrible events—provide an inexhaustible source of information about the Famine. It is precisely this category of sources that first revealed the truth about this tragedy to the world.

In Ukraine such testimonies were published for the first time in 1991 in a small book by O. Mishchenko titled *Bezkrivna viina* (Bloodless War). The book contains memoirs of the author's compatriots—residents of the Kozelshchyna district, Poltava oblast.<sup>18</sup> In *33-i: Holod; Narodna knyha-memorial* (1933: Famine; People's Book-Memorial, 1991), a compendium of oral sources that is unique in content, factual information, and value, Lidiia Kovalenko and Volodymyr Maniak have compiled a huge number of eyewitness testimonies.<sup>19</sup> The collection contains a thousand memoirs about the Famine, arranged according to a geographic scheme of seven regions corresponding to administrative-territorial divisions. The material is presented in several forms: literary texts, transcriptions from recorded oral accounts, and summary accounts based on information from several respondents. On occasion lists of Famine victims in particular villages supplemented the testimonies.

Kovalenko and Maniak's work has been continued in an analogous compilation entitled *Ukrain'skyi Holokost 1932-1933* (Ukrainian Holocaust 1932-1933),<sup>20</sup> which contains two hundred testimonies collected by students of Dnipropetrovsk University and the University of Kyiv-Mohyla Academy in areas of Dnipropetrovsk and neighboring regions (Kirovohrad, Poltava, and Cherkasy oblasts and, in the Russian Federation, Kuban, Rostov, and Kursk oblasts).

On the micro-historical level, within the bounds of one rural council, we can find testimonies of Famine survivors from the village of Severynivka (Sumy region) in H. Ivanushchenko's collection, *Holodomor 1932-1933 rokiv* (The Famine-Genocide 1932-33).<sup>21</sup> The testimonies of eyewitnesses of the national tragedy were also included in other editions of sources.

<sup>18</sup> Oleksandr Mishchenko, *Bezkrivna viina: Knyha svidchen'* (Kyiv: Molod', 1991). 176 pp.

<sup>19</sup> *33-i: Holod; Narodna knyha-memorial*, compiled by Lidiia Kovalenko and Volodymyr Maniak (Kyiv: Radians'kyi pys'mennyk, 1991). 584 pp.

<sup>20</sup> *Ukrain'skyi Holokost 1932-1933: Svidchennia rykh, khto vyzhyv*, compiled by Iurii Mytsyk (Kyiv: Vydavnychiy dim "KM Akademiia," 2003). 296 pp.

<sup>21</sup> H. Ivanushchenko. *Holodomor 1932-33 rokiv: Ochyma svidkiv, movoiu dokumentiv; Severynivska sil'rada Sums'koho raionu* (Kyiv: Ukrain'ska Vydavnycha Spilka, 2003). 60 pp.



In general, from 1998 to 2003, 22 separate documentary collections or books of memoirs and more than 20 journal and 150 newspaper selections have been published. Approximately 10,000 texts of original documents, testimonies, and memoirs, recorded after a considerable lapse of time (60 to 70 years), have been put into circulation. As might be expected, the published documents constitute only a small part of the entire corpus of archival sources on the history of the Famine-Genocide currently housed in the state archives. However, on the whole, they offer a clear idea of the sources on which knowledge of the 1932-1933 famine in Ukraine is based.

The magnitude of that deliberate disaster, the awareness of Party and state leaders about a possible social upheaval, the authorities' need to suppress the Ukrainian village, the existence of channels of secret recordkeeping and circulation of documents among the different agencies—all were factors that generated written information at all levels of government about the causes, extent, and consequences of the Famine. These records constitute, so to speak, the first type of document about the Famine. The second type consists of the enormous flow of letters, complaints and claims, and statements and accounts concerning the true state of the rural population's suffering from starvation, which were sent to Party committees, governmental agencies, and newspaper editors. Both types of document are primarily kept in the archival holdings of central Party and governmental agencies: the CC CPU, the Politburo, the Secretariat and its departments (in charge of administration, personnel, and information), and oblast and district Party committees, such as the All-Ukrainian Central Executive Committee (VUTsVK), the Soviet of Peoples Commissars of the Ukrainian SSR; the Peoples Commissariats of Internal Affairs, Food, Land Affairs, Education, Public Health, and Justice; the Public Prosecutor's office, the Supreme Court, the Central Auditing Commission, and the Workers' and Peasants' Inspectorate, as well as corresponding agencies on the oblast, district, and village levels, committees of poor peasants (*komnezamy*), political departments of MTS (machine and tractor stations), children's homes, agricultural cooperatives, and so forth.

The distinguished scholar Ruslan Pyrih has selected several groups of documents from the archives of the CC CPU: first, proceedings of congresses, conferences, and plenary sessions of the CC CPU, decrees of the Politburo and the Secretariat, and documents of the Central Committee's departments; second, decrees of local committees, and other materials of oblast, city, and district Party committees that were transmitted to the republic headquarters of the All-Union Communist Party; third, briefings from governmental agencies that were sent to the attention of Party leaders; and fourth, citizens' appeals to the Central Committee. Only a small portion of

these have remained intact to this day, since during the evacuation in the summer of 1941, owing to the unavailability of means of transportation, the majority of documents in the archives of the CC CPU, including materials from governmental departments, were destroyed. The only documents that managed to survive were those cataloged as part of the archival holdings of the CC's Politburo.

Documents of central state agencies (housed at the archive of the Higher Agencies of Government) of the Ukrainian SSR contain important information that enables us to understand the real reasons for the Famine, reveals the mechanism of repression against the peasants, and shows the role of republic leaders in carrying out Moscow's policy with regard to the Ukrainian village. They contain the laws and decrees of VUTsVK, the decrees of the Soviet of Peoples Commissars (at times issued jointly with the CC CP(b)U), decrees of the people's commissariats, memoranda, and information from these state agencies. The most informative materials, however, are not the official documents, but rather the numerous appeals of collective farmers, independent farmers, workers, Red Army servicemen, and the rural intelligentsia to VUTsVK, the Soviet of People's Commissars, and the people's commissariats.

Two groups of related documents in the archives of Ukraine's western regions may be singled out. The first group is concerned with the efforts of Ukrainian organizations and the Ukrainian Greek Catholic Church to organize aid to victims of the Famine on Soviet territory and to hold demonstrations in support of their starving compatriots. The second group contains information from official Polish agencies, including diplomats, about events in the Ukrainian SSR and about refugees from the Ukrainian republic who testified before the relevant agencies of the Polish Republic.

Thus, geographically, the resource materials on the history of the Famine-Genocide cover virtually the entire territory of modern Ukraine, with the possible exception of Transcarpathia, which during the 1930s was part of the Czechoslovak Republic, and the Autonomous Republic of Crimea — at the time, a part of the Russian Socialist Federated Soviet Republic (RSFSR).

In general, we are talking about more than fifteen hundred archival holdings of institutions and organizations that operated on the territory of twenty-three of the present-day oblasts of Ukraine. The archives contain more than two hundred thousand files. This corpus constitutes an exceptional and extremely rich source base, which has not yet been arranged as a self-contained information base of documentation of the past.

A separate group consists of documents from different agencies created by the law enforcement structures of the time (the GPU, the Peoples Commis-

sariat of Internal Affairs). Among these, special attention should be paid to information from the GPU agencies of the Ukrainian SSR. First of all, they were created within a punitive system whose main objective "on the internal front" was to expose and prevent counterrevolutionary acts. Second, in view of the scale of the Famine, only the GPU organization with its broad network of agents and unlimited power could secure—or falsify—a complete body of information about the Famine-Genocide. Third, researchers today have at their disposal only one category of documents produced by the GPU: namely, those documents intended for the information of the CC CP(b)U, which were subsequently filed in the Party records of that period. Their content is similar to that of the general corpus, with the exception of such specific types of sources as dispatches "by direct wire" and special communications. The documents were produced on three hierarchical levels—district, oblast, and republic, and their material may be classified into three types—those conveying orders, information, and analysis.

Famine-Genocide documents of a statistical nature may be arranged according to the time frame they cover: one day, five days, seven days, ten days, two weeks, one month. One should also note the classification of statistical data concerning the scale of the Famine: the number of districts involved, the number of settlements within each district affected by famine, the number of households, the number of inhabitants — specifically, adults and children, collective farmers, and individual farmers, the number of people with swollen bodies, ill, or dead from starvation, and the number of cases of cannibalism. The GPU documents reveal that a high degree of attention was paid to subjective aspects of Famine events. In particular, there are descriptions of the political opinions of the peasants, workers, and intelligentsia, as well as of the frightening phenomenon of cannibalism. According to Ruslan Pyrih, the analysis of available documents proves that as food shortages rose and mass starvation increased, the GPU became the most important agency responsible for collecting and summarizing statistical information. At the height of the tragedy, in the spring and beginning of the summer of 1933, this agency became the only likely source of such information. The facts reported in the GPU documents are highly reliable, and they are consistent with our view of the historical setting in which they occurred. The material reflects the realities of the day: the anti-kolkhoz moods and actions of the peasants, the protest actions of the workers, the rise of religious feelings, difficulties with food supply, mass starvation, out-migration for work, homeless children, epidemics, high mortality, cannibalism, and so forth. On the other hand, the statistical figures regarding the number of starvation victims as presented by the GPU agencies, especially at the highest level, require seri-

ous verification against other sources, because in many cases the numbers of dead and ill were often lowered, even when compared with the figures provided by Party agencies.

Recently declassified documents from the archives of different divisions of the Ministry of Internal Affairs of Ukraine in the 1930s are of great interest in view of the fact that they reveal the true scale of the Famine-Genocide and the repressive measures taken to suppress the people's dissatisfaction with the regime's policy. In this respect, the most important archive is that of the Agricultural Enterprises Department of the GPU in the Ukrainian SSR, which administered and controlled the activities of agricultural enterprises. Another important source are documents related to the trials of Ukrainian citizens during the Famine and the practice of exile as punishment. The state archives of the Ministry of Internal Affairs and its regional branches house two thousand files from the period of the Famine-Genocide. They appear to have been put together in a very crude way, and strike the careful reader with their lack of investigative evidence or other proofs consistent with the criminal code.

Unique and unknown until recently are 164 court cases for persons convicted of cannibalism. As a rule, only the protocols are attached to the file, without any supporting evidence. The protocols have two columns: "case heard" and "decision adopted." The latter includes the means of punishment: execution or ten years in a concentration camp. The frightening geographical range of cannibalism cases is revealing: about 40 percent of the cases were in Kyiv oblast; 27 percent in Kharkiv oblast; 14 percent in Odesa oblast; and 7 percent in Dnipropetrovsk oblast.

A separate category consists of the criminal files of "special settlers," who were deported from Ukraine by administrative order from 1920 to 1950. Some 425,000 files have survived for persons resettled in 1932-1933 to the Krasnoiarsk territory, Irkutsk oblast, Komi Autonomous Soviet Socialist Republic, Kemerovo and Tomsk oblasts, and other areas. The files of special settlers are a unique historical source, one that reveals the reasons for the deportation of Ukrainian citizens, their categories, the scale of repression during a particular historical period, and the geography of mass terror. They also make it possible to identify the social and ethnic groups that were the special targets of the system of repression. At the same time, the files were an essential component of the criminal procedures of the time, the records of which are distinguished by the intentional falsification of documents, distortions of facts, and mistakes in surnames.

Another part of the Famine-Genocide documentary base includes the registry of death records maintained by the Civil Registry of Vital Statistics

(ZAGS). At present, they are kept at archival establishments subordinated to the Ministry of Justice of Ukraine, and remain virtually an untouched field for researchers of the Famine-Genocide. In spite of the fact that the birth and death records (*metrychni knyhy*) were for the most part destroyed by order of the GPU, and that information about the causes and scale of death has been falsified, some registry books for 1932-1933 have, nevertheless, survived. It is impossible to calculate the total figure of Ukraine's population loss due to the Famine, but it is possible to analyze data in a regional breakdown (on the village and district levels). Both types of these resource collections remain practically unknown to researchers and publishers.

Photo documentation deserves separate investigation and research. For obvious reasons, the state archives did not preserve photographic evidence of the regime's crimes as part of official documentation. That is why, at present, all we have at our disposal are a few photographs from the collection of the Viennese Cardinal Theodor Innitzer and photographs taken by foreign correspondents. All of them were initially published in the 1930s in the Western press and were later republished many times, prompting numerous discussions.

Owing to the extremely limited base of photo sources, photographs from a different historical period and other regions are occasionally published as documentary evidence of the Famine-Genocide. As a rule, such photos come from the period of the first Soviet famine in 1921-1922 on Russian territory. Since it was convenient, at the time, for the Bolsheviks to present the famine—which had actually been caused by the state's policy of "war communism"—as a consequence of foreign military intervention, they willingly allowed these photo documents to be widely circulated. Due to the absence of authentic photo sources of the 1932-1933 Famine-Genocide, these same photographs have been used over and over. Even a recent publication on the Famine-Genocide by the Ukrainian Canadian Research and Documentation Center seems to include at least one photograph from Russia in 1921.<sup>22</sup>

In general, today we can speak of a certain exhaustion of the source base for investigating the Famine-Genocide in Ukraine as well as the exhaustion of traditional forms of documentary publications. There is a clear need to make Famine-related documentary evidence available on a broader scale. Having agreed to continue publications of newly revealed and recently unclassified archival documents, especially those on the regional level, the

<sup>22</sup> Wsevolod W. Isajiw, ed., *Famine-Genocide in Ukraine, 1932-1933: Western Archives, Testimonies, and New Research* (Toronto: Ukrainian Canadian Research and Documentation Centre, 2003), 96-7.

State Committee on Archives of Ukraine, jointly with the Ministry of Education and Science and the National Academy of Sciences, has initiated the preparation of a popular edition of a new kind—a documentary reader about the Famine-Genocide to be used as a textbook for all those who study the history of twentieth-century Ukraine in schools, gymnasiums, colleges, and universities. This publication will contain the most striking and representative of the published documents — those that reveal the causes, course, and consequences of the Famine-Genocide, the suppression of truthful information about it, and aid efforts and protest actions.

There is also a need to widely circulate additional sources about the Famine that have not yet been explored—above all, those that are held in the archives of foreign countries. In particular, this category includes documents housed in the central Party-state agencies of the USSR, which are now kept in the archives overseen by the Federal Archival Agency of Russia (the Russian State Archive of Socio-Political History and the Russian State Archive of Modern History), the Archive of the President of the Russian Federation, and the departmental archives of law-enforcement services—the successors of the NKVD (Peoples Commissariat for Internal Affairs) and the OGPU of the 1930s. With a few exceptions, these documents are still unknown in Ukraine. Let us recall that the Archive of the President of the Russian Federation received the complete holdings of the former Archive of the Politburo of the Central Committee of the Communist Party of the Soviet Union, which had held all of the most important decrees, proceedings of meetings and conferences, announcements, and the correspondence of Joseph Stalin with other members of the Politburo. At present, almost all of this material is classified as secret. Most likely the multilingual *Tragediia sovetskoï derevni, 1927-1939* (The Tragedy of the Soviet Countryside, 1927-1939)<sup>23</sup> is the only publication on the problem of the Famine that contains documents from the Central Archive of the Federal Security Service of the Russian Federation, the Russian State Archive of Socio-Political History, and other federal archives of Russia (with the exception of the Archive of the President of the Russian Federation). Even a cursory analysis of the second volume shows the need for a detailed study of the holdings of the Russian federal archives for the purpose of further research on documentary evidence about the Famine-Genocide. Out of a total of seventy documents in the volume relating to Ukraine, only seventeen have been published in Ukrainian collections. Moreover, the Moscow

<sup>23</sup> *Tragediia sovetskoï derevni: Kollektivizatsiia i raskulachivanie; Dokumenty i materialy V 5 tomakh, 1927-1939*, ed. V. Danilov et al, vol. 1, *Mai 1927-Noiabr' 1929* (Moscow: ROSSPEN, 1999); vol. 2, *Noiabr' 1929-Dekabr' 1930* (Moscow: ROSSPEN, 2001), 928 pp.; vol. 3, *Konets 1930-1933* (Moscow: ROSSPEN, 2001), 1008 pp.

volume contains fifteen documents extant in Ukrainian archives—from the republic and oblast level party committees, as well as information from the republic GPU about events in Ukraine—that have never been included in the Kyiv editions. This fact, in particular, compels us to develop strategies for searching in Moscow for documents that the Ukrainian archives do not have, not only on the all-Union, but also on the republic level.

Another promising project would be for Ukrainians to research the still untapped corpus of documentary sources about the Famine-Genocide in Ukrainian areas of the Russian Federation, namely, Kuban, Rostov, and other oblasts adjoining Ukraine.

One more category of little-known sources, though indirect, is the information of diplomatic representatives, correspondents, and secret service agents from Great Britain, Italy, Canada, Germany, Poland, Romania, the United States, France, and Czechoslovakia for the years 1932-1933. Currently, only a small portion of those diplomatic documents has been published. Although British, Italian, and German archives may be considered largely examined, only some of the Polish diplomatic documents have been published, and the archives of foreign diplomatic agencies of other countries neighboring Ukraine in the 1930s have not been researched at all.

A final avenue that can be used to augment the Famine-Genocide source base is the collection of oral testimonies and memoirs of eyewitnesses of the tragedy (survivors) and their descendants. Everywhere oral history sources occupy an important place among historical documentation. The initiative of the devoted first researchers of the oral history of the Famine-Genocide—Maniak, Kovalenko, and Mishchenko—continues today in the work of state archives and universities of Ukraine. Collections of memoirs of surviving victims and eyewitnesses of the Famine are held in the archives of Vinnytsia, Dnipropetrovsk, Lviv, Sumy, and Cherkasy oblasts. This work obviously requires coordination, as well as serious methodological and financial support, with a view to the urgency of the task given the age of potential respondents.

The Internet offers broad opportunities for publishing documents in order to preserve the memory of one of the greatest tragedies of the twentieth century. In recent years, the World Wide Web has evolved into an extraordinary information resource: an elementary set of keywords (Famine, Genocide, Holodomor, Ukraine) prompts search engines to offer a list of more than eighteen thousand results. A search using only Ukrainian keywords comes up with over a thousand results. Among these are special websites on the Famine-Genocide run by official agencies, public organizations, and memorial

associations; sections about the Famine on other sites; published documents, official materials, investigations, and reviews of sources; press releases, official statements, and speeches; internet exhibits of documents and art; hundreds of publications on the topic at sites about Ukrainian history, modern world history, or the history of communism; special sections on electronic tourist information about Ukraine; data from electronic library catalogs, other bibliographic references, and so on.

Nevertheless, even a superficial review of the Internet sources on the Famine shows that researchers and publishers of documents have clearly not yet fully realized the opportunities for making archival Famine materials available on the Internet. Out of several thousand web references, we can find only two dozen or so of the more informative, specialized websites or web pages that present documentary resources on the subject in a minimally adequate way.

First of all, these are the two Ukrainian sites. The first, titled "Poshuky i znakhidky: Pershodzherela z pytan' Holodomoru v Ukraïni 1932-1933 rr. (Medychnyi Aspekt Problemy)" (Searches and Findings: Primary Sources concerning the 1932-1933 Famine in Ukraine [Medical Aspects of the Problem]), is the first Ukrainian Internet journal on the history of medicine.<sup>24</sup> On the site, the editor-in-chief, Vadym Kohan, has published a review of archival documents on the medical aspect of the Famine. He was the first to introduce to the scholarly world an unexpectedly significant collection of documents from central and local public health agencies and medical institutions that are housed in the Central State Archive of Higher Agencies of Government and Administration of Ukraine (TsDAVO), and the state archives of Kyiv, Dnipropetrovsk, Kharkiv, Odesa, Cherkasy, and Kherson oblasts. (It should be noted that at least twelve thousand files of the Peoples Commissariat for the Public Health of Ukraine from the 1930s were destroyed in 1941, on the eve of Kyiv's occupation.) The documents that were saved characterize the medical problem of the Famine-Genocide along the following lines: the impact of food shortages prior to and during the Famine period on the state of general health organizations and medical workers in rural areas; the starvation and illness rate of the population (including infectious diseases); statistics about starving persons and patients whose bodies were swollen from lack of protein and the number of those who died

<sup>24</sup> See Vadim Kogan, "Search and Findings: Primary Sources concerning the Famine in Ukraine in 1932-1933 (Medical Aspects [of] the Problem), *Agapit* ([The Ukrainian Historical and Medical Journal, National Museum of Medicine of Ukraine], Kyiv), no. 13 (2002), <http://www.histomed.kiev.ua/agapit/agl/ag01-15e.html>; reprinted on the website [ArtUkraine.com](http://www.artukraine.com), <http://www.artukraine.com/famineart/medasp.htm>.



from starvation; the falsification of diagnoses; population growth and loss (birth and death rates in individual districts); the homeless rate for children and adults; methods of fighting these phenomena; the sanitary conditions of children's institutions; the turnover among medical personnel in rural areas; the use of food substitutes to feed the starving population; poisoning and diseases caused by the consumption of unsuitable plant and animal food substitutes; aid for the starving from public health agencies.

The second Ukrainian site, titled "Uroky istorii: Holodomor 1932-33 rr." (The Lessons of History: the Famine-Genocide of 1932-33) was created in August 2003 by the "Ukraine 3000" Foundation.<sup>25</sup> The authors of the new site have announced the beginning of a large-scale publication that will include testimonies of famine witnesses, which are being collected by Taras Shevchenko National University of Kyiv students with the help of an original questionnaire composed by Professor Valentyna Borysenko, and also documents from Ukrainian archives and diplomatic reports.

Among the non-Ukrainian sites, special attention should be paid to a website that is rich in content and contains more resources than any other—"Holodomor v Ukraïni 1933 r." (Famine-Genocide in Ukraine in 1933), created by the Famine Genocide Commemorative Committee of the Ukrainian Canadian Congress (Toronto branch) between 1998 and 2002.<sup>26</sup> Oddly enough, however, it contains only a limited number of documents: two British diplomatic reports; an item already widely available on the Internet—the resolution of the Soviet of People's Commissars of the Ukrainian SSR and of the CC CP(b)U dated December 6, 1932, on blacklisting villages that "maliciously sabotage the collection of grain"; five fragments of memoirs about the Famine; the full text of Pavlo Makohon's well-known memoir; and, finally, two texts from the testimony of eyewitnesses before the Ukraine Famine Commission in Washington, D.C., on October 8, 1986. In the summer of 2003, photo documents from the newspaper *Chicago American* from 1935 were posted on the website for a brief time, but were later removed, apparently owing to uncertainty about whether they were actual photos of the 1933 Ukraine Famine.

Eyewitness accounts from the second volume of *The Black Deeds of the Kremlin: A White Book* have recently been put on the website "The Ukrainian

<sup>25</sup> "Ukraine 3000" Foundation, "Uroky istorii: Holodomor 1932-33," <http://golodomor.org.ua/>.

<sup>26</sup> Famine Genocide Commemorative Committee, Ukrainian Canadian Congress, Toronto Branch, "Famine-Genocide in Ukraine 1932-1933," <http://www.faminegenocide.com/>.

*Weekly pro Holodomor 1932-1933 rr. v Ukraïni* (*The Ukrainian Weekly on the Great Famine 1932-1933 in Ukraine*).<sup>27</sup>

A short overview of an oral history collection is provided on the site of the Ukrainian Canadian Research and Documentation Centre (UCRDC Archival Collection).<sup>28</sup> The collection consists of approximately eight hundred audio and video interviews in English and Ukrainian, including audio records of testimonies by Famine-Genocide witnesses recorded between 1981 and 1988 and published by the United States Congress Commission on the Ukraine Famine.

The United States Library of Congress has published, on its website, part of an internet exhibit of documents from the Russian archives. Among them is the document mentioned above, the Resolution of the Soviet of Peoples Commissars of December 1932. The website of the Center for Holocaust and Genocide Studies at the University of Minnesota also includes a copy of the Resolution of 1932.<sup>29</sup>

Finally, excerpts from Welsh journalist Gareth Jones's diary relating to the Famine in Soviet Ukraine during March 1933 have also been published on the internet (facsimile and transcription), along with his newspaper articles.<sup>30</sup>

Therefore, the more than modest collection of source publications on the Internet may be said to comprise the following: a single document (and even that—a copy) from the Russian archives, some two dozen testimonies, memoirs, and diary entries, and several overviews of sources. That is the sum total. One of the reasons for internet "source poverty" is the cost-free access to archival documents that it allows, which makes it impossible for the owners of source materials to protect copyright on the Web. This problem is made manifest on the website of the Ukrainian Canadian Research and Documentation Centre, which includes a price list for providing copies of documents. On the eve of the seventieth anniversary of the Famine, the State

<sup>27</sup> Ukrainian National Association, *The Ukrainian Weekly*, [Great Famine Section], [http://www.ukrweekly.com/Archive/Great\\_Famine/index.shtml](http://www.ukrweekly.com/Archive/Great_Famine/index.shtml).

<sup>28</sup> Ukrainian Canadian Research and Documentation Centre, [see esp. sections "Archives," "Documentaries," "Publications," and "Projects"], <http://www.interlog.com/~ucrdc/>.

<sup>29</sup> Library of Congress Exhibitions "Revelations from the Russian Archives: Ukrainian Famine," [see "Memorandum on the Grain Problem" and "Translation of Memorandum"], <http://www.loc.gov/exhibits/archives/ukra.html>; Center for Holocaust and Genocide Studies, Links and Bibliography, "Ukraine Famine and Genocide: 1929-1935," [http://www.chgs.umn.edu/Links\\_Bibliography/Links/U\\_-\\_V/u\\_-\\_v.html](http://www.chgs.umn.edu/Links_Bibliography/Links/U_-_V/u_-_v.html).

<sup>30</sup> For more information on the Welsh investigative journalist, see the website entitled "Gareth Richard Vaughan Jones, Hero of Ukraine (1905-1935)" <http://colley.co.uk/garethjones/>.

Archives of Ukraine created a special source section on its website, where the following items appeared: **(1)** the conditions of the period of the late 1920s-early 1930s: a presentation of the "visual interior" of collectivization and the Famine-Genocide through official photo documents from the collection of the H. S. Pshenychnyi Central State Motion Picture, Photograph, and Sound Archive of Ukraine (TsDKFFA), with the option of downloading an unlimited number of high-quality images; **(2)** a bibliography of published Famine sources, overviews of sources, and catalogs of archival documents on the topic; **(3)** an annotated list of Internet resources, as well as annotation of the latest source publications. This part of the site is also available on the compact disc recently issued by the State Committee on Archives of Ukraine.<sup>31</sup>

In conclusion, it should be noted that one of the most effective and promising formats for making archival resources widely available, including the Famine topic, is publishing in microform. In 2002 the State Archives of Ukraine began joint projects with the leading publisher of archival collections, the U.S. company Primary Source Microform.<sup>32</sup> All those who are interested may now acquire the first collection on the Famine: documents from the former Party archive (Central State Archive of Public Organizations of Ukraine [TsDAHO], formerly the Archive of the CC CPU). Finally, I would like to note the generous, longstanding support of the Ukrainian Studies Fund for numerous publishing and Internet projects aimed at the broad exposure and dissemination of Ukraine's archival resources.

<sup>31</sup> Archives of Ukraine, "Famine in Ukraine 1932-1933: Official Photo Documents, Source Publications; Bibliography, Surveys, Internet Resources," <http://www.archives.gov.ua/Sections/Famine/index.php>. Also available as a CD under the same name; see list of CDs published by the State Committee on Archives of Ukraine, <http://www.archives.gov.ua/Publicat/CD/index.php>.

<sup>32</sup> See *Holodomor: Famine in Ukraine, 1932-1933, from the Central State Archive of Popular Organizations*, Kiev (Woodbridge, Conn.: Primary Source Microform, 2004), 158 reels. Microfilm collection of documents from the Central State Archive of Public Organizations in Ukraine (Tsentral'nyi derzhavnyi arkhiv hromads'kykh ob'iednan' Ukraïny, TsDAHO), fond 1, "Central Committee of the Communist Party," opys 1, 6, 16, and 20; and fond 7, "Central Committee of the Lenin Youth Communist League of Ukraine," opys 1.